

CORRECTIONS to 'THE MANNA OF ECCLESIOLOGY'

(*The Record*, volume 42, winter 2006/7, pages 3 to 32)
(which may be detached and inserted at the appropriate place)

Seven endnotes corrected April 2007 by Tom Davidson Kelly

Page 27

24 Tom Davidson Kelly, *Living stones: the daughter churches of Govan Parish, 1730 – 1919* (Glasgow: Friends of Govan Old, forthcoming 2007) and Leishman 1921, pp 70 – 1.

Page 28

45 Aberdeen engraver Andrew Gibb sent a copy of Campbell's article with a covering letter dated 10 Jan 1868 to John Stuart, Secretary of the Society of Antiquaries. Murray Collection, Special Collections, University of Glasgow, Mu5-e11.7. Donation by Andrew Gibb of 'Heraldic Ceiling of the Cathedral Church of [St Machar,] Aberdeen', *Proceedings of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland*, 7, p.398. Principal William D. Geddes and Peter Duguid, *The Heraldic Ceiling of the Cathedral Church of St. Machar, Old Aberdeen* (Aberdeen: New Spalding Club, 1888), pp x – xi, acknowledged the role of Principal Campbell: 'To the name of the late Principal Campbell a special tribute of acknowledgment is due, not only for the great trouble and pains he bestowed, in the year 1867, on the// details of the entire restoration, both heraldic and structural, but also for the excellent little sketch, which he composed at the time, and contributed to the *Herald and Genealogist* (vol. v., p. 9), giving an account of the Roof and the three series of Shields. This sketch, which consists of only a few pages, contains figured illustrations of *ten* out of the forty-eight shields, and forms a valuable nucleus which has been found useful for the construction of the present work.'

Page 29

50 See appendix 1. i for detailed list, compiled from Kerr, *The Renaissance of Worship* (Edinburgh: Gardner Hitt, 1909) (hereafter Kerr), *TAES* and *Fasti*

Ecclesiae Scoticanae (hereafter *Fasti*). Principal Sir George Adam Smith identified 2 groups recruited by Cooper: ‘ministers of his own and other churches’ and ‘young architects’ and artists. ‘A Retrospect’, *TSES*, Vol 9, Part 2, 1928 – 9 (1929), pp 68 – 9.

51 See appendix 1. ii for detailed list, compiled from Kerr, *TGES* and *Fasti*.

52 See appendix 1. iii for detailed list, compiled from Kerr, *Annual*, *TSES* and *Fasti*.

Page 30

93 *Annual*, 38, 1968, pp 14 – 16. ‘The building has the appearance of a bold experiment. It immediately makes one think of the other St Columba’s erected in 1592 at Burntisland. Mr Ian Lindsay has written of the Burntisland church: “the experiment was not repeated in quite that form, for in general new churches were to carry on the pre-Reformation tradition, so far as the structure was concerned, and were gradually to develop from that.”’ Dr John W. Fraser, ‘On Behalf of the Chancel’, *Annual*, 32, 1962, pp 32 – 4, quoting Ian G. Lindsay, *The Scottish Parish Kirk* (Edinburgh: St Andrew Press, 1960), p.41. Note the perceptive discussion of the process of commissioning and the influence of the project by Diane Watters, ‘St Columba’s, Glenrothes: A post-war design laboratory for reformed worship’, *Architectural Heritage XII* (2001), 66 – 87. It is perplexing that recent literature applauds that one-off design as representative of the increasingly pervasive and anachronistic idea that there is a specific ‘Reformed church planning’. For example: ‘... the end of the sixteenth century saw a small number of churches built according to Reformed planning. Most notable is the church at Burntisland, Fife.’ Neil Cameron, ‘Worship and Commemoration’, *Scottish Life and Society, Vol 3. Scotland’s Buildings* (East Linton: Tuckwell, 2003), p. 285.

Page 31

131 See appendix 2 for detailed list, compiled from *TAES*, *TGES*, *TSES*, the archives of the Royal Scottish Academy and Esme Gordon, *The Royal Scottish Academy of Painting, Sculpture and Architecture, 1826 - 1976* (Edinburgh: Charles Skilton, 1976).