

Reviews.

OUR HERITAGE IN PUBLIC WORSHIP: The Kerr Lectures, delivered in Trinity College, Glasgow, in 1933. By D. H. Hislop. (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1935. 10/- net.)

The object of this book is to show the Scottish Church as inheriting, or entitled to inherit, all that is valuable in the worship of Christendom, as this has developed under the many varieties of time, place, and circumstance.

Mr Hislop draws attention at the outset to some encouraging features of present-day religious thought: a renewed emphasis on the objective in religion and on corporate worship, and (as a consequence of this) an increased interest in liturgical form and order. Taking worship as we find it in our land to-day, he claims for it, as for all worship, that therein something is done, something depicted, and something uttered. This brings him to the thesis which forms the groundwork of the whole book—that worship must contain three elements—must involve at once Sacrifice, Drama, and Oracle. After a chapter on the psychological factors in worship (of which he has also treated in an able article in the present number of this *Annual*), he examines the extent to which the above elements are present in the worship of the New Testament.

In the historical survey which follows, the author shows how these several elements were given expression by the various branches of the Christian Church. The Drama of Mystery is specially characteristic of the worship of the Eastern Church. "Its centre is a Divine process rather than a Divine event; its core the Incarnation rather than the Atonement; its emphasis is the Divine Being rather than the Divine action or Word."

The Roman Church it was that chiefly developed the idea of sacrifice. "In its attitude Western worship is orientated to the expiation of Christ's death as the East is towards the Incarnation. In its atmosphere Western worship aims at a certain end and specific purpose; definite

in statement and purposeful in action, it seeks to achieve an object, while the East is shadowed with mystery and vague with wonder."

In Lutheran, and still more in Reformed worship, which is the accepted type in our own country, the third element, which had tended to be ignored, is given renewed prominence. "At the Reformation there came into Scotland with the force of a creative spirit a form of worship whose centre was the idea of revelation and the proclamation of the Word."

In the worship of the Church of England—a *Via Media*, an attempted synthesis—"there is no one dominant idea. This is by no means a weakness, for in this rite are found the idea of Sacrifice, the influence of the Mystery Drama, and the Oracle type of devotion." And even in the silent worship of Quakerism Mr Hislop sees an attempted reconciliation of the three elements, though at too ideal and abstract a level.

In the latter and practical part of the book the author treats of the Eucharist as the central rite in the Christian Church. "It is the primitive and characteristic act of Christian devotion . . . The three cultural forms of human religion, the Sacrifice, the Mystery, and the Oracle, have been employed to express the fact which lies within the circle of sacramental ideas." The same three elements should be evident in weekly worship, which (if the Communion be not celebrated) is best regarded as a *Missa sicca*, a "shadow Eucharist." In the closing chapters he shows how the sacrificial idea can be given effect to in prayer, and the dramatic element in a symbolism that, while appealing to eye as well as ear, must take account of man's intellectual needs and mystical aspirations. When to these are added their necessary complement—the declaration of the Word—we have a worship that combines what is best in the Protestant temper and the Catholic spirit, "the mystical approach through the ascent of man's spirit, and the revelational approach through the descent of the Divine."

Mr Hislop's book demands concentrated attention, and is provocative of thought. He will not expect all his conclusions to carry universal approval, and it may sometimes be felt that his divisions and sub-divisions are too clear-cut and elaborate to be always satisfying. It may also seem to some of us that in his plea for richer form and colour and his criticism of the bleakness and bareness of

our traditional worship he has done somewhat less than justice to the austere simplicity and solemnity of our own Communion Service. But this is not said by way of belittling the value of a book which brings to our notice the treasures of devotion to be gathered from such a wealth of sources. While we think of the various Churches as branches of one tree, it is an equally helpful metaphor to regard them as tributaries of one river, each making its own contribution, large or small, to feed a stream which grows in width and volume as it flows onward.

THOS. MARJORIBANKS.

VITAL ELEMENTS IN PUBLIC WORSHIP: By J. Ernest Rattenbury. (Epworth Press. 5/- net.)

Dr Rattenbury is the distinguished President-Designate of the Methodist Conference. The Methodist Church, since the union which, a few years ago, brought to it a great increase of strength, has given many evidences of a deep concern about its methods of public worship. One of its early acts, which Scotland might well emulate, was to see that all its Divinity Colleges which were not already so equipped, should be provided with chapels for the public and private devotions of its students. A newly-published manual of responsive worship approved by the Conference, and officially issued, is reviewed on another page of this *Annual*. And this present book by one of the most honoured figures in Methodism raises many questions connected with the Church's worship which are bound to provoke in the minds of those for whom it is primarily intended much fundamental and, it may well be, revolutionary thought.

The opening chapters are devoted to an outline of the origins of Christian worship, and the medieval development which resulted in the dual types of Roman and Protestant worship. There is good in both types, and justice is done to both. The weaknesses of both are faithfully indicated. "There is no doubt much in Catholic ritual to criticise. A great deal of it is, at the best, a mere anachronism, and at the worst, sentimentality, superstition, and even idolatry. But with all that, no Protestant can deny that it has kept alive Objective worship. The great fact that it affirms is the real Presence of Christ. God in Christ is at its centre,

however much He may be hidden by unessential and irritating trappings." From modern Protestant worship on the other hand, the spirit of reverent, loving, adoring awe is often strangely absent. The reason is that it is subjective; objectivity has been largely lost. This is not a necessary characteristic of Protestantism; the great Reformers of the sixteenth century preserved the Catholic tradition, which ought never to have been departed from. Dr Rattenbury sums up the difference between the two types in a comparison between an ancient and a modern hymn. The ancient Church sang "We praise *Thee*, O God, we acknowledge *Thee* to be the Lord." Certain modern Protestants sang, and probably still sing, "O that will be, glory for *me*." The present writer was once taken to task for saying that the latter hymn "reached the ultimate nadir of unevangelical egotism." The expression was not too strong. Hymns of that nature, which are still too numerous, sin (that is the right word) just there; they alter the focus of worship, they assert the centrality of self in the universe. "What we need," says Dr Rattenbury, "is *God* at the centre, not *me*."

He pleads therefore for the restoration of objectivity by making God central to common devotion. As means to that end, he suggests the cultivation of a sense of the difference between public and private worship (the severe individualism of some forms of Protestantism has tended to rob corporate worship of the dignity and colour it demands); definite observance of the recurring events of the Christian Year; weekly celebration of Holy communion, which more than anything else makes for objectivity in worship; and the use of intervals of silence, especially silent adoration.

Of extemporary prayer he has severe things to say. "Generally speaking, little of it is extemporary except its careless phraseology. The difference in practice between the extemporary and the written prayer is that the same things are said in good English in the one case, and in poor on the other, only in extemporary prayer it is very easy in addition to forget or neglect objects for which prayer ought to be made." Wesley believed that *normal* worship would best be expressed by liturgical forms; he even said there was less formality in the Anglican liturgies than in some long Nonconformist prayers. Use should be made of the great historic treasures of devotion. Dr Rattenbury thinks the efforts to provide richer rites and liturgical prayers,

which are a remarkable feature of Church life to-day, are of good omen, but hopes that enthusiasts will not stultify themselves by too much originality. "One can prophesy with confidence that new public prayers will suffer a high degree of infant mortality."

Against some modern practices he makes a strong protest. What he calls the tip-up chair mentality has had a bad influence on Methodist worship; the introduction of pews with no kneeling accommodation had previously done great disservice. Of the address to children he has nothing but what is unfavourable to say. "The traditional orderly, reverent worship of the Methodist people has been greatly disturbed by the interval of children's entertainment." He declares that in his considered judgment nothing during the present century has done more harm to reverent worship than the interpolation into it of addresses to children, and the ministerial facetiousness too often associated with them. "What is needed to brighten worship is the emphasis of its objective character." These observations gain weight from the fact that they embody the experience of the writer as a worshipper, since he has had large opportunity of looking at all these questions from the point of view of the occupant of the pew.

The final chapter is devoted to the Order of Holy Communion. It is in the main a commentary on the Order (based on the Anglican) at present used in Methodism, with indication of the proposed changes and restorations of the Ancient Order, which are to be submitted to the Conference for approval. This commentary is valuable.

The debt of Methodism to Dr Rattenbury will be shared by Scottish readers (of whom we hope there will be many), for the sound wisdom of his argument, the refreshing pungency with which many of his opinions are expressed, and the power with which he presents his plea "that to-day a restoration of certain neglected corporate and historical elements of devotion in our public services is essential to truly balanced Christian worship."

MILLAR PATRICK.

DIVINE WORSHIP. (Epworth Press. Paper, 1/- net; also 1/6 and 2/6.)

The inheritance of the Methodist Churches included two traditions of worship, liturgical and free. Both have

elements of value which, it is felt, ought to be conserved and blended. The merits and defects of the two forms are excellently discussed in the introduction to this little book. The need has been felt for forms of responsive worship, and in the present book an attempt has been made to meet the need by the provision of ten different orders for general use, four for special seasons, and a collection of additional prayers and responsive acts of worship. These are admirably drawn up, and they suggest the line along which, it may be, the Scottish tradition of resolute silence on the part of the congregation in public devotion may be best attacked and broken down. It will be interesting to discover what the fortune of the experiment will be in the Church which has authorised it, "in the hope that it may lead to disciplined experiment in new ways of corporate worship, but above all, that it may deepen the interest of many in the high task of public worship, and may stimulate them to bring to it 'the soul's collected powers.'"

MILLAR PATRICK.

THE CATHEDRALS OF ENGLAND : By Harry Batsford, Hon. A.R.I.B.A., and Charles Fry. With a foreword by Hugh Walpole. (London : B. T. Batsford, Ltd. 7/6.)

THE ENGLISH ABBEY : By F. H. Crossley, F.S.A. With a foreword by the Rt. Hon. W. Ormsby-Gore, M.P., F.S.A. (London : B. T. Batsford, Ltd. 7/6.)

THE PARISH CHURCHES OF ENGLAND : By J. Charles Cox, LL.D., F.S.A. Edited with additional Chapters by Charles Bradley Ford. With a foreword by the Very Rev. W. R. Inge, D.D., K.C.V.O. (London : B. T. Batsford, Ltd. 7/6.)

The firm of Batsford, Ltd., is doing a great work in issuing these beautiful volumes of the British Heritage series. Both as regards letterpress and illustration these recent additions to the literature dealing with English Cathedrals, Abbeys, and Churches are worthy of the highest praise.

"The Cathedrals of England." In this work, we have probably the best collection of Cathedral photographs which has been issued in this country, and the publishers' claim that here the new technique of photography has been used

for the first time to illustrate these glorious shrines appears to be justified. But the work is valuable quite apart from its illustrations. We are given an account of every Anglican Cathedral, the various buildings being described with simplicity and skill. Here we are presented with descriptions not only of the mediaeval Cathedrals, but also of the "Parish Church Cathedrals," which in later days have been pressed into service as the Bishops' seats of the newer dioceses. The modern Cathedral of Liverpool, designed with what the writer calls "an originality and free vision which are very refreshing," has here a paragraph which one would willingly have seen longer. The same is true of another modern building, that of Guildford, of which a provisional sketch is given showing what the complete work will be like. It promises to be a valuable addition to the many fine Anglican sanctuaries.

"The English Abbey" is on somewhat different lines from the other two volumes, for here we have not so much a description of the ancient abbeys scattered up and down the land, as a sympathetic study of the life lived by the monks in these old-time monasteries. In the introduction Mr Crossland deals with the origins of the monastic life, and tells us something of the different orders of monks who from time to time built their sanctuaries in our land. There was a certain element of the desire to "hive off" from the parent body (which has been such a marked feature of Scottish Presbyterianism) in those earlier orders. Though Mr Crossland does not mention the fact, the Cluniac and Cistercian attempts to get back to a more primitive rule were also attempts to introduce a system whereby the central body would have more control over the individual houses than was the case with the Benedictines. We are shown how the daily life of the monastery went on, what were the duties of the Abbot, Prior, Sacrist, and other officials, the relationship which the "conversi" bore to the rest of the brethren, and also the relationship of the hired servants to both. We see how the Abbey buildings took shape and how the mediaeval mason did his work. Lastly, we learn something of the dealings of the monks with their neighbours and with their own tenants. While the Benedictines encouraged the growth of villages around their dwellings, the Cistercians usually sought a place apart; their foundations being more of an economic unit than those of their "black" brethren.

“The Parish Churches of England” is based on that excellent work of Dr Cox which has been out of print for some years, “The English Parish Church.” It has, however, been revised throughout, and is in some ways an entirely new book. We are taken over the various districts of England, visiting churches of Saxon, Norman, Gothic, Renaissance, and Modern workmanship. A chapter is devoted to the evolution, arrangement, and planning of the average Parish Church. The author shows how the buildings have increased as the centuries went past. A number of the great churches of to-day were at one time only small naves with something of the nature of an apse for a chancel.

All three books are marvellously illustrated. Where there are so many fine illustrations it is difficult to give the palm to any; but that of Lincoln Cathedral from the north-west, the evening view of Kirkstall Abbey and the River Aire, and those of the screens of Plymtree (Devon) and Bovey Tracy in the same county deserve special mention. A quaint interior is that of Avington, Hampshire, with the pulpit on the side wall just as in some old-fashioned Scottish churches. The pulpit canopy is surmounted by the figure of a bird not unlike those which were at one time features of some Secession churches.

A good index is provided in each volume, and in the first and last a glossary of the principal terms used is also given.

WILLIAM M'MILLAN.

Notes on recent Church Publications.

HANDBOOK TO THE CHURCH HYMNARY (Supplement):
Edited by the Rev. Millar Patrick, D.D. Oxford
University Press. (London: Humphrey Milford.)

This valuable Supplement forms a most useful addition to the Handbook published some years ago. The Editor is Dr Millar Patrick, who himself took no small part in the preparation of the main book, and whose notes in this Supplement are of absorbing interest and testify to a vast amount of painstaking research. Besides containing a number of additional annotations on the hymns and tunes already referred to, and their authors and composers, the book will be valued for the notes on those tunes in the

Scottish Psalter in Metre (issued 1929), which were not included in the *Revised Church Hymnary*. To give but a single instance, no one could read such an account as that given of the glorious "Old 124th" (pp. 82 ff.) without realising what a rich store of historical associations that grand tune possesses in addition to its intrinsic beauty. The Supplement can be had either separately (1/6) or bound up with the original Handbook (6/-).

THE SCOTTISH SERVICE BOOK, FOR THE USE OF HIS MAJESTY'S FORCES. Issued by the Committee on Chaplains to H. M. Forces.

The value of this little book is not to be measured by its size. Besides a selection of psalms, paraphrases, and hymns (including a few in Gaelic and Welsh) and passages of Scripture, the booklet contains a full order of Divine Service to be used in the absence of a Chaplain, and a number of prayers, in dignified but simple language, for the seasons of the Christian year, and other special services. In preparing this book the Committee has been assisted by Ministers of the other Presbyterian Churches of Great Britain and Ireland.

Two recent additions have been made to the useful series of *Occasional Papers*, issued by the Committee on Public Worship and Aids to Devotion. Paper No. 7, *A Year's Praise*, compiled by Dr Marjoribanks and the Rev. J. Wilson Baird, gives suggested lists of praise for morning and evening services throughout the Christian year, along with a reference to suitable anthems for each season, which should prove helpful to both Ministers and organists. Paper No. 8, *Musical Services*, compiled by Dr Wauchope Stewart and the Rev. G. W. Wright, gives an order for services such as may be used at the second diet of worship at special times such as Christmas, Passiontide, Easter, and Harvest. Suitable readings, psalms, hymns, and anthems are indicated.